



Dated: 06-11-2023

**EVALUATION REPORT**  
**(As Per PPRA Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)**  
**FINANCIAL EVALUATION REPORT**

01	Name of Procuring Agency	<b>Karachi Port Trust</b>
02	Method of Procuring	Notice for inviting Tenders through News Papers Published in Daily The Nation & Daily Ausaf at on 16-July-2023, KPT & PPRA Websites, under PPRA Rule 36(a) from Bidders i-e Single Stage One Envelope.
03	Title of Procurement	<b>Construction of 08 Nos. Security Check Posts and 02 Nos. Guard Rooms at East &amp; West Wharves, Karachi</b>
04	Tender Inquiry No	E/CW-1(587)/
05	PPRA Ref No. (TSE)	<b>TS515594E</b>
06	Date & Time of Bid Closing	10-08-2023 at 11:00 AM
07	Date & Time of Bid Opening	10-08-2023 at 11:30 AM
08	No. of Bid Received	04 (Three) Nos.
08	Criteria of Bid Evaluation	Lowest Evaluated Bid under Rule 36(a) PPRA
09	Detail of Bid (s) Evaluation	<u>As Per Departmental Tender Committee Report (attached).</u>

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Marks		Evaluated Cost	Rule / Regulation / SBD / Policy / Basis of Rejection/Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules,2004
		Technical (If Applicable)	Financial (If Applicable)		
1.	M/s. Ammar Enterprises	Qualified	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest	Rs. 32,699,008.59	Lowest Bid Accepted
2.	M/s. Mehtab Traders	Qualified	2 <sup>nd</sup> Lowest	Rs. 32,950,944.08	
3.	M/s. Suntech International	Qualified	3 <sup>rd</sup> Lowest	Rs. 33,871,881.65	
4.	M/s. S.R Enterprises	Qualified	4 <sup>th</sup> Lowest	Rs. 39,930,275.23	

**Most Advantageous Bidder: - M/s. Ammar Enterprises,**

**11. Any other additional /supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share (DTC Report and Comparative Statement, Technical Evaluation Sheet).**

Signature   
**Executive Engineer (E)**  
**Engineering Department**  
**Karachi Port Trust**

**Official Stamp**

**Head Office. Eduljee Dinshaw Road I. I. Chundrigar Road, Karachi Phone # 99214530-40 Fax # 99214329-30**




S/4037


## COMPARATIVE STATEMENT

<b>NAME OF WORK</b>		<b><u>CONSTRUCTION OF 08 NOS. SECURITY CHECK POSTS AND 02 NOS. GUARD ROOMS AT EAST &amp; WEST WHARVES KARACHI.</u></b>	
<b>FILE NO.</b>		E/CW-1(587)	
<b>ESTIMATED COST</b>		Rs. 33,320,000.00	
<b>DATE OF OPENING OF TENDER</b>		10-08-2023	
<b>S.No.</b>	<b>Name of Bidder</b>	<b>Amount of Earnest Money with Pay Order No Date &amp; Bank</b>	<b>Amount Quoted Rs.</b>
1.	M/s. Ammar Enterprises	Rs.1,000,000.00 Pay Order No.14547858 Dated 09-08-2023, Allied Bank, Ancholi Society Branch Karachi.	Rs. 32,699,008.59
2.	M/s. Mehtab Traders	Rs.1,000,000.00 Pay Order No. 01108514 Dated 09-08-2023 SindhBank DHA Phase-5, Branch Karachi.	Rs.32,950,944.08
3.	M/s. Suntech International	Rs.1,000,000.00 Pay Order No.26722452, Dated 08-08-2023, HBL, New Challi Branch, Karachi.	Rs. 33,871,881.65
4.	M/s. S.R Enterprises	Rs.1,000,000.00 , Pay Order No.00030155 Dated 10-08-2023, Bank Al-Falah, Clifton Branch Karachi.	Rs. 39,930,275.23

  
CHIEF ENGINEER  
(MEMBER)

  
COMMANDANT (PSE)  
(MEMBER)

  
MANAGER FINANCE  
(MEMBER)

  
DIRECTOR PORT INTELLIGENCE  
(MEMBER)

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE**  
**04-09-2023 IN THE OFFICE OF CHIEF ENGINEER, ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT, K.P.T.**

**NAME OF WORK: CONSTRUCTION OF 08 NOS. SECURITY CHECK POSTS AND  
02 NOS. GUARD ROOMS AT EAST & WEST WHARVES, KARACHI.**

**INTRODUCTION:**

1. Port Security Department, vide their letters of even dates placed at S. No. 1,2,3. considering the prevailing law and order situation in the country, has requested for the construction of additional Check Posts and Guard Rooms for the security surveillance of valuable premises / land of KPT through Port Security Staff by the trespassers/ terrorists/ land grabbers etc.
2. Subsequently, Ministry of Maritime Affairs forwarded a letter of Premier Agency on the subject issue and directed for the fool proof security arrangements of the key points of KPT Installations (reference places at S. No. 7).
3. In the light of above, a survey for the same was carried out by the Assistant Executive Engineer (W-I) along with the in-charges of Port Security Department, who identified the major / critical key points on the premises of KPT. (Para at S. No. 10 to 10/C)
4. Accordingly, an Estimate For the Civil works amounting to Rs. 29,155,746 including of Contingencies and 13% SRB has been prepared by the Concerned Executive Engineer (S. No.14/A). However the Estimate for Electrical Works was requested by the CM&EE-II Department for inclusion in the consolidated estimate for inviting tenders from the eligible bidders, as per procedure in vogue. (Reference placed at S.No.17). However, despite of several reminders, the estimate of 02 Guard Rooms is still not received from CM&EE-II Department, resulted loss of the precious time.
5. The CM&EE Department, after issuance of the 6<sup>th</sup> reminder on dated 02/05/2023, reference placed at S.No.17, informed Dy. Chief Engineer-III, (S.No.20) that the work for the 02 Guards Rooms at KPT Hospital shall taken up by the CM&EE Department at their own, through Departmental resources for which estimate is no more required.
6. Considering the situation as illustrated above, the estimate for Construction of 08 Security Check Posts & 02 Guard Rooms have been consolidated with the forwarded Estimate of Electrical Works of 08 Security Check Posts amounting to Rs.3,320,000.00 (inclusive of all Taxes & 13% SRB), processed for inviting tenders.
7. Accordingly, note was out-up note at PP-7 & 8 for approval of Plan & Estimate & was forwarded to Chairman KPT & the same got duly approved by the Chairman KPT (ref. placed at PP-12).
8. Tenders for the work were therefore invited under 36 (a) of PPRA Rules through Press on 16-07-2023 & KPT / MoMA & PPRA Websites on 17-07-2023 and were received on 10-08-2023.
9. In response following Four (04) Firms submitted their sealed Technical & Financial Proposals 10-08-2023 as per the Advertisement.

S. No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Ammar Enterprises
2.	M/s. Mehtab Trader
3.	M/s. Suntech International
4.	M/s. S.R Enterprises

10. Technical & Financial Proposals for the above 04 firms were opened on same day in the presence of the Committee Members or their representative viz:

1.	Rep. of Chief Engineer	Convener
2.	Rep. of Manager Finance	Member
3.	Rep. Commandant (PSF)	Member
4.	Reps. of Director Port Intelligence	Member

11. After the opening of Technical & Financial Proposals, an In-house Committee comprising on the following members was constituted by the Chief Engineer KPT vide letter at S.No.30, to examine the received Technical & Financial Bids as per criteria and submit their Technical Evaluation Report as per the practice in vogue.

1.	Engr. Ismail Soomro	Dy. Chief Engineer-I	Convener
2.	Engr. Syed Jamil Akhter	Executive Engineer (W)	Member
3.	Engr. Unaib Bhojani	Asstt. Executive Engineer (W)	Member
4.	Mr. Haris Usman	Rep. of Manager Finance	Member

12. Evaluation of the Technical & Financial Bids has been carried out as per the criteria and the documents provided by the bidders. The detailed chart duly signed by the Technical Evaluation Committee as per the Technical & Financial Evaluation Report (Placed at S.No.31), Two Bidders are stood Technically qualified:

S.No	Name of Firms	Technical Status	Financial Bid Price	Status / Ranking
1.	M/s. Ammar Enterprises	Qualified	Rs. 32,699,008.59	1 <sup>st</sup> Lowest Responsive Bid
2.	M/s. Mehtab Trader	Qualified	Rs.32,950,944.08	2 <sup>nd</sup> Lowest Responsive Bid
3.	M/s. Suntech International	Not Qualified	Rs. 33,871,881.65	Non-Responsive Bid
4.	M/s. S.R Enterprises	Not Qualified	Rs. 39,930,275.23	Non-Responsive Bid

#### **PARTICULAR**

- a) Authority of Sanction. KPT Board's
- b) Budget Provision figures. Rs. 50.0 (M)
- c) Estimated Cost Rs.33,320,000.00
- d) Debit Head The expenditure for cost of work will be debited to "Annual Development Program (ADP)" Account Code No. 01013012-082199 (Sundry Small Buildings) Project No.14208, wherein an amount of Rs.50.0 (M) have been proposed in the Budget of 2023-2024.
- e) Date on which Tender was Published on Press and display on KPT, MoMA & PPRA Websites 16-07-2023  
17-07-2023
- f) Date of opening of Tenders. 10-08-2023
- g) Total No. of Tenders Sold. Not known (Uploaded from Websites)
- h) Total No. of Tenders received. 04 Nos.
- i) Date when Departmental Tender Committee meeting held. 01-09-2023
- j) Detail of offers received.
- | <u>S.No.</u> | <u>Name of Tenderers</u>   | <u>Tendered Amount Including 5%Contingencies</u> | <u>Corrected Bid Amount Including 5% Contingencies</u> |
|--------------|----------------------------|--|--|
| 1.           | M/s. Ammar Enterprises     | Rs. 32,699,008.59                                | Rs. 32,699,008.59<br>(1.86% Below)                     |
| 2.           | M/s. Mehtab Trader         | Rs. 32,950,944.08                                | Rs.32,950,944.08<br>(1.10% Below)                      |
| 3.           | M/s. Suntech International | Rs. 33,871,881.65                                | Rs. 33,871,881.65<br>(1.65% Above)                     |
| 4.           | M/s. S.R Enterprises       | Rs. 39,930,275.23                                | Rs. 39,930,275.23<br>(19.84% Above)                    |
- k) Position of offer recommended for acceptance as compared with other offers Lowest Responsive Bid / Most Advantageous Bid
- l) Validity period of the offers. 180 Days expiring on 07-02-2024
- m) Past performance of the tenderer recommended and how they behaved in the past. M/s.Ammar Enterprises is registered in C-2 Category with Pakistan Engineering Council. They have not carried out of works in KPT. But carried out many works in other Department as per their profile.

**RECOMMENDATIONS:**

The Lowest Responsive Bid / Most Advantageous Bid amounting to Rs.32,699,008.59 (Rupees: Thirty Two Million Six Hundred Ninety Nine Thousand Eight & Fifty Nine Paisa Only) received in accordance under Clause PPRA Rule 36 (a) from M/s. Ammar Enterprises. which is 1.86% below the corresponding estimated cost of Rs.33,320,000.00 based on KPT draft amended schedule of rates (2002) 2013 and as per current market rates is considered reasonable. Keeping in view of their past performance as mentioned in para (m), M/s. Ammar Enterprises will be considered capable for carrying out the work viz **“CONSTRUCTION OF 08 NOS. SECURITY CHECK POSTS AND 02 NOS. GUARD ROOMS AT EAST & WEST WHARVES, KARACHI”**.

The Committee as per the recommendation of In-house Committee report, recommends the acceptance of the Lowest Responsive Bid / Most Advantageous Bid amounting to Rs.32,699,008.59 (Rupees: Thirty Two Million Six Hundred Ninety Nine Thousand Eight & Fifty Nine Paisa Only) received from M/s. Ammar Enterprises for the work viz **“CONSTRUCTION OF 08 NOS. SECURITY CHECK POSTS AND 02 NOS. GUARD ROOMS AT EAST & WEST WHARVES, KARACHI”**.



CHIEF ENGINEER  
(MEMBER)

2/2/13



COMMANDANT (PSF)  
(MEMBER)



GENERAL MANAGER (CW)  
CONVENOR



MANAGER FINANCE  
(MEMBER)



DIRECTOR PORT INTELLIGENCE  
(MEMBER)